

Reviewer 3:

Reviewer:

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit: Excellent

Explanation to the applicant:

Applicant has demonstrated in several ways--undergraduate honors research, independent post-BA fellowship research--the ability to take a project from start to finish, including several presentations, a technical report, a publications. Hence, there is ample evidence of this applicant's ability to plan and conduct successful research. The applicant's proposed research is situated within the larger VEP project at WSU and that project has been immensely successful. What is less clear is the degree to which the applicant's research is independent. While the work proposed will examine potential alliance formation at large spatial scales, it does so from the same platform of data being developed for other/additional purposes by VEP. This alone would not be so critical in this assessment but added to it is the absence of archaeological analyses and expectations that would be employed to test the simulations the applicant will complete.

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts: Excellent

Explanation to the applicant:

The applicant addresses broader impacts in all three essays, most effectively suggesting how her own background and experiences encourage diversity--of views, of people, of places in anthropology and archaeology. Applicant's research will enhance scientific/technical understanding given the modeling of past climate, population, and settlement-subsistence in the Mesa Verde region of the SW, although much of this is being done by the other major collaborators on this project. Applicant's work in her hometown teaching archaeology to at risk students demonstrates commitment to integrating research and education and in a variety of ways applicant is a role model showing how through our efforts and training we can benefit society as individuals and members of a profession.

Reviewer 2:

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit: Excellent

Explanation to the applicant:

Crabtree's proposal is theoretically strong and yet builds on prior research. Modeling of coalition relationships and alliance more generally is a positive step in the overall area of ABM that she presents. She also understands the need to consider the strengths of previous work such as that of Gavrillets that she mentions. Since conflict is part of the culture history of the Mesa Verde region, no matter how limited, she should be cognizant of how and when conflict impinges on her model, or is caused by the variables that may also result in cooperation. There are sources on ancestral Puebloan warfare that are not mentioned, even though the direction of her research is toward cooperation and coalition building.

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts: Excellent

Explanation to the applicant:

Crabtree has an excellent vision of the application of her research beyond archaeology. In addition to traditional dissemination of results that is implied in the proposal, it would be useful to hear how her research results may best be transmitted to those who will benefit from its lessons for today. The decision-makers in positions of power who might be able to take advantage of these "lessons from the past" do not always receive research results, or get them in "undigested" form and tend to set them aside. With her background in developing creative research endeavors, Crabtree might put her mind to planning ways to see that the insights she gains reach the people she would like to receive them.

Reviewer 1:

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit: Excellent

Explanation to the applicant:

The applicant proposes to give just as much attention to archaeological evidence for cooperation as for conflict in the trajectory of development and demographic collapse of Pueblo communities in the Mesa Verde region (infamous for claims of cannibalism and mass violence). She proposes to use rigorous computer modeling as well as ethnographic evidence from descendant communities (and I would urge a look at Tanoan, Keres, and Zuni sodalities, clans, and dual divisions, not just Hopi clan-based sodalities. The diversity among Pueblo solutions to conflict is fascinating and sure to be informative. Also, mobility is part of the answer here). The applicant has demonstrated a great deal of flexibility, initiative, and drive, and has broad preparation in anthropology generally as well as "real world" experience in applied (compliance) archaeology.

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts: Excellent

Explanation to the applicant:

This is an applicant who takes broader impacts seriously. She has already demonstrated commitment to human rights, education for disadvantaged children, furtherance of women's self-determination and educational opportunities, both in the US and abroad. Her volunteer activities speak to initiative, independence, and commitment. Further, she links her research to contemporary issues of climate change, violence, and the question of humans are to live in communities in the face of changing economic and environmental circumstances.